

Minutes of the Meeting of the Planning Committee held on 13 July 2023 at 6.00 pm

Present: Councillors Tom Kelly (Chair), Georgette Polley (Vice-Chair), Paul Arnold, Adam Carter (Substitute for Councillor Terry Piccolo), Steve Liddiard, Jacqui Maney, Joycelyn Redsell (Substitute Item 10 for Councillor Maney) Sue Shinnick and Lee Watson.

Steve Taylor, Campaign to Protect Rural England
Representative

Apologies: Councillors Terry Piccolo

In attendance: Leigh Nicholson, Assistant Director of Planning, Transport and Public Protection
Matthew Gallagher, Major Applications Manager
Nadia Houghton, Principal Planning Officer
Lucy Mannion, Senior Planning Officer
Julian Howes, Senior Highways Engineer
Linda Saunders, Legal Representative (via Microsoft Teams)
Kenna-Victoria Healey, Senior Democratic Services Officer

Before the start of the Meeting, all present were advised that the meeting may be filmed and was being recorded, with the audio recording to be made available on the Council's website.

11. Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 8 June 2023 were approved as a true and correct record.

12. Item of Urgent Business

There were no items of urgent business.

13. Declaration of Interests

Councillor Maney declared an interest in Item 10 Planning Application 22/01637/FUL, Belhus Park Golf And Country Park and following legal advice would not be taking part in the application and that Councillor Redsell would be substituting for her.

The Chair of the Committee Councillor Kelly addressed Members advising he understood there had been a number of emails received from Members of the public relating to Item 9 Planning Application 22/01672/FUL, Thurrock Football Club, Ship Lane, Aveley RM19 1YN and having spoken with the

Legal Representative felt that he could hear the application and make a decision with a clear and open mind.

14. Declarations of receipt of correspondence and/or any meetings/discussions held relevant to determination of any planning application or enforcement action to be resolved at this meeting

The Chair of the Committee declared the following correspondence on behalf of the committee, and it was agreed this had been received by all Members:

- X6 Resident emails in objection to to Item 9 Planning Application 22/01672/FUL, Thurrock Football Club, Ship Lane, Aveley RM19 1YN
- The Chair of Grays Athletic, supporting Item 9 Planning Application 22/01672/FUL, Thurrock Football Club, Ship Lane, Aveley RM19 1YN
- Julian Sutton, Agent for to Item 9 Planning Application 22/01672/FUL, Thurrock Football Club, Ship Lane, Aveley RM19 1YN
- Councillor Panjanla, objecting on behalf of residents, Item 9 Planning Application 22/01672/FUL, Thurrock Football Club, Ship Lane, Aveley RM19 1YN

15. Planning Appeals

The Assistant Director of Planning, Transport and Public Protection presented the report to Members.

RESOLVED:

That the report be noted.

16. 22/01370/FUL: Land adjacent Watts Wood including Mardyke Farm, Ship Lane and Broomhill, Arterial Road, Purfleet-on-Thames, Essex

The application was deferred by Chair to receive clarity on Legal advice which had been given before the start of the meeting regarding the eligibility of Members who could vote on the item.

17. 22/01672/FUL: Thurrock Football Club Ship Lane, Aveley, RM19 1YN

The report was presented by the Major Applications Manager, who during his update advised on late representations and highlighted the following:

- There had been two previous similar application refused
- This was Inappropriate development in the Green Belt
- There was harm to openness and the purposes of including land in the Green Belt
- When looking at the balancing exercise, harm to the Green Belt was not clearly outweighed by other considerations.

During the debate the Chair commented he welcomed the additional jobs to the borough and the location of the site was close to major road networks.

Councillor Arnold stated it was a difficult decision to make, as he understood Grays Athletic Football Clubs search for a new home ground. At the same time, from the site visit he saw the amount of Green Belt land which would be lost should the application be granted.

Councillor Carter mentioned he felt the application could bring value to area, as well as new jobs and a home for the football club it could bring the community together.

Councillor Watson too agreed she sympathised with the football club, however she did not feel it was acceptable development in the Green Belt.

The Vice-Chair, Councillor Polley stated she felt the Committee voting for a site visit at the last meeting was the right choice to make and echoed Members comments that to make a decision on the application was a difficult one.

Councillor Kelly observed that during the debate it was clear the vote in favour of the officers recommendation of refusal was as follows:

For: (3) Councillors Paul Arnold, Sue Shinnick and Lee Watson

Against: (3) Tom Kelly (Chair), Georgette Polley (Vice-Chair) and Adam Carter.

Abstained: (0)

With the Chair having the casting vote, Councillor Kelly invited the Assistant Director of Planning, Transport and Public Protection to address the committee.

The Assistant Director of Planning, Transport and Public Protection advised the Constitution was clear that an alternative recommendation would need to be out forward, which met with council policies.

Councillor Kelly Chair of the Committee while acknowledging of harm to the Green Belt and the openness of the Green Belt proposed to approve the application as it was considered that significant weight should be attached to both the economic benefits of the proposals and the provision of a HGV turn-round facility on Ship Lane and was seconded by Councillor Polley.

For: (4) Tom Kelly (Chair), Georgette Polley (Vice-Chair) and Adam Carter.

Against: (0) Councillors Paul Arnold, Sue Shinnick and Lee Watson

Abstained: (0)

Members were advised that report would be brought back to a future meeting of the Committee in line with the Council's Constitution.

Councillor Redsell joined the Committee for Item 10 on agenda at 7.34pm

18. 22/01673/FUL: Belhus Park Golf And Country Park, Belhus Park Lane, Aveley, RM15 4PX

This application was deferred by the Committee following legal advice as the applicant had failed to serve the correct notice on affected landowners when the application was submitted.

Councillor Redsell left the Committee at 7.34pm and Councillor Maney joined the Committee for the remainder of the meeting.

19. 23/00149/HHA: Lyndfield, Orsett Road, Horndon On The Hill, Essex, RM16 3BH

The report was presented by the Principal Planning Officer, during which she summarised the following:

- The application proposed a first floor side extension to the already extended dwelling in the Green Belt
- The development would amount to inappropriate development in the Green Belt that would be harmful by definition.
- The arguments put forward by the Applicant as Very Special Circumstances do not clearly outweigh the harm caused to justify the inappropriate development.
- The same identical proposal was Refused and Dismissed at Appeal in 2019 for being harmful to the openness of the Green Belt.

There was one question from Cllr Liddiard asking whether there was any proposal to convert any of the existing outbuildings. The officer explained the proposals did not involve the existing outbuildings.

Speaker statements were heard from:

- Statement of Support: Councillor B Johnson, Ward Member
- Statement of Support: Ms J Thompson, Agent via MST

Councillor Kelly Chair of the Committee proposed the officer's recommendation of refusal and was seconded by Councillor Polley.

For: (6) Councillors Tom Kelly (Chair), Georgette Polley (Vice-Chair), Paul Arnold, Adam Carter, Steve Liddiard and Jacqui Maney.

Against: (2) Councillors Sue Shinnick and Lee Watson.

Abstained: (0)

20. 19/01556/OUT: Kings Farm / Thurrock Airfield, Parkers Farm Road, Orsett, RM16 3HX

This application had been withdrawn at the request of the applicant.

21. 21/02190/FUL: Land Adjoining Tamarisk Road, South Ockendon, Essex

The report was presented by the Senior Planning Officer, who summarised the application as follows:

- This was redevelopment a previously developed site to provide new homes
- National planning policies require a presumption in favour of housing development where there is no 5-year housing supply
- The proposal met policies in terms of the design and layout
- There would be no unacceptable impacts to any neighbouring properties
- With mitigation, there would be no unacceptable impacts in terms of highways

During Members discussions the contributions offered by the applicant, were commented upon, during which it was mentioned there was a contribution towards the Councils 5-year housing supply and the contribution to health provisions should be increased. The Senior Planning Officer advised that the NHS supplied the figures for the health provision contribution and the Council were not able to increase these.

Speaker statements were heard from:

- Statement of Support: Mr A Ryley, Agent

The Committee agreed to suspend standing orders at 8.15pm to allow the agenda to be completed.

At the debate, Members remarked the scheme proposed was not in keeping with the local area and felt that parking would be an issue. It was further commented that the overall design of the development was not in keeping with the current street scene or the character of the Flowers Estate. The lack of affordable housing and the level of contribution towards local healthcare was also discussed. Members considered the level of healthcare contribution was too low.

The Chair thanked Members for their comments and sought if anyone wished to recommend the Officers recommendation. Councillor Kelly Chair of the Committee then proposed the officer recommendation to approve the application and was seconded by Councillor Carter.

For: (3) Councillors Tom Kelly (Chair), Adam Carter and Steve Liddiard.

Against: (5) Councillors Georgette Polley (Vice-Chair), Paul Arnold, Jacqui Maney, Sue Shinnick and Lee Watson.

Abstained: (0)

The Assistant Director of Planning, Transport and Public Protection advised the Constitution was clear that an alternative recommendation would need to be out forward, which met with council policies.

Councillor Polley Vice-Chair of the Committee proposed to refuse the application and was seconded by Councillor Arnold on the basis of the following four areas:

- i) Design and appearance of the application being out of character with the current street scene and the Flowers Estate.
- ii) Level of parking provision,
- iii) The impact on healthcare,
- iv) Noise and the insulation provided for the units to the rear backing on to the railway line, and the quality of the build.

For: (5) Councillors Georgette Polley (Vice-Chair), Paul Arnold, Jacqui Maney, Sue Shinnick and Lee Watson.

Against: (3) Councillors Tom Kelly (Chair), Adam Carter and Steve Liddiard.

Abstained: (0)

Members were advised that report would be brought back to the Committee assessing the concerns raised by Members in line with the Council's Constitution.

The meeting finished at 9.10 pm

Approved as a true and correct record

CHAIR

DATE

**Any queries regarding these Minutes, please contact
Democratic Services at Direct.Democracy@thurrock.gov.uk**